

## EVALUATION OF YOUTUBE AS A LEARNING MEDIA IN THE VOCATIONAL EDUCATION

**Muslikhah Dwiheartanti**

Faculty of Economics and Business, State University of Yogyakarta, Indonesia

[muslikhah@uny.ac.id](mailto:muslikhah@uny.ac.id)

**Sutirman**

Faculty of Economics and Business, State University of Yogyakarta, Indonesia

[sutirman@uny.ac.id](mailto:sutirman@uny.ac.id)

**Kustitik**

Faculty of Economics and Business, State University of Yogyakarta, Indonesia

[kustitik@uny.ac.id](mailto:kustitik@uny.ac.id)

**Ilham Ramadan Pandu Setia Negara Siregar**

Faculty of Economics and Business, State University of Yogyakarta, Indonesia

[ilhamramadan@uny.ac.id](mailto:ilhamramadan@uny.ac.id)

### ABSTRACT

YouTube has now become a popular learning resource used in education. Previous studies have found that YouTube is an unqualified source of information, lacks clarity of sources, and has low accuracy. The purpose of this study is to evaluate the learning videos available on the YouTube search engine whether they are suitable for use as learning media in vocational learning. This research is an evaluative research using a quantitative approach. The video feasibility test uses *expert judgment*, namely by media experts and material experts. The data collection instrument used a questionnaire developed by Morain and Swarts (2012) on the quality of learning videos. Data were analyzed using descriptive analysis. The result of this study is that most of the learning videos on YouTube for learning electronic document management are of good quality and feasible to use as learning media in the vocational field. Recommendations for further research are that follow-up needs to be done to see the effect of learning videos on YouTube on the level of student understanding.

**Keywords:** YouTube, Learning Media Evaluation, Vocational Education.

### INTRODUCTION

Vocational education is one of the fields of education that is expected to be able to produce skilled workers who are experts in their fields and ready to work (Sugiyo et al., 2020). The implication is that learning in the field of vocational education is expected to represent the working conditions of the industrial world so that students will be able to apply it well when they enter the world of work (Suharno et al., 2020). Therefore, educators are required to be able to develop effective and enjoyable learning according to the characteristics of their students (Dunlosky et al., 2013) because understanding the characteristics of students is the main key in achieving learning success (Maudini & Nurhasanah, 2018; Purwanti & Vania, 2021). Study results state that students in higher education today are dominated by generations born between 1995-2012 or often referred to as generation Z (Rakhmah & Azizah, 2020). As a generation born and raised in the era of easy internet access, Generation Z prefers digital-

based information sources and is more comfortable searching for information on audio-visual search pages such as the YouTube *platform* (Rakhmah & Azizah, 2020).

The office administration study program is one of the fields of expertise in vocational education that produces graduates to become experts in the field of office administration (Nofiantoro, 2018). One of the competencies that must be mastered by students in the study program is archiving, which has more practical learning activities (Sutirman et al., 2023). Referring to the characteristics of students who are mostly generation Z and the characteristics of practice-based courses, one of the learning media that can be used as archival learning media is learning videos integrated with the YouTube *platform* (Milheim, 2012a). Empirically, this learning media has proven to be effective and can be useful in the learning process, including: making it easier for students to understand the material provided (Islam et al., 2021), increasing learning motivation (Sistadewi, 2021), and increasing students' participation in learning activities (Rahayu, 2021). In addition, learning videos also have the advantage of not being bound by time and space, meaning that the video can be accessed by students from anywhere, anytime, and can be studied repeatedly (Copper & Semich, 2015).

The many benefits of using videos in learning encourage educators to utilize videos on the YouTube *platform* as a learning resource (Mutoharoh et al., 2022; Purwandari, 2019). However, the videos that are widely used are not the result of the educator's own development, but only take from videos that are already available on YouTube. In fact, the ranking of videos on YouTube is based on popularity, relevance, and viewing history, not quality (Mohamed & Shoufan, 2022). A study conducted by Ferhatoglu et al. (2019) found that the information on YouTube has low quality and accuracy, and the content does not have clear sources. Next, the results of a study conducted by Celik et al. (2020) also corroborated these findings that videos on the YouTube *platform* are of low quality. Thus, it is necessary to conduct an in-depth study whether the videos available on the YouTube search engine meet the requirements as a good learning media through this research.

Vocational education has taken center stage in recent years, especially with dynamic changes in technology and learning methods. In this digital era, YouTube offers great potential as a medium for vocational learning. An in-depth evaluation of the use of YouTube in archival learning is needed to ensure its effectiveness in supporting student understanding, practical skill development, and achievement of vocational learning objectives.

#### 1. YouTube Evaluation in Archival Learning Media

YouTube as the world's largest video-based *platform* has changed the way we access information and learning. Mohamed and Shoufan (2022) stated that YouTube not only provides abundant learning resources, but also becomes a significant self-learning medium. Hew and Lo (2020) presented information on the influence of video type on students' preferences. In the context of archival learning, choosing the appropriate type of video, such as practical demonstrations or interactive tutorials can enhance students' understanding and practical skills.

Chartrand et al. (2021) that linked self-directed learning through video with practical skill development in university students showed interesting results. A similar evaluation in the archival context could assess the extent to which YouTube is effective in supporting the development of practical skills, such as how to organize and manage archives.

#### 2. YouTube Evaluation in Vocational Learning

Liu and Elms (2019) emphasize the power of animation as an effective pedagogical tool on YouTube. Animation combines audio and visual messages, allowing for the presentation of complex concepts in an engaging way. The use of animation in an archival context can be an interesting strategy.

Boateng et al. (2016) showed that students often find the length of videos too long to be a challenge in vocational learning. This evaluation can provide insights into how to

effectively present archival materials on the YouTube *platform* with students' preferences in mind.

Aldallal et al. (2019) investigated the use of YouTube as a self-directed learning resource in dental education. This evaluation showed that students seek out YouTube for self-directed learning and assessed that the use of YouTube in the classroom increased student engagement, understanding, and overall satisfaction. A similar evaluation in an archival context could provide an overview of how well YouTube supports vocational learning inside and outside the classroom. Despite its merits, a thorough evaluation is needed to understand the impact of YouTube on vocational learning, particularly in archives.

## METHOD, DATA, AND ANALYSIS

This research is an evaluative research using a quantitative approach. This research is directed to assess whether learning videos on YouTube are suitable for use as learning media in the vocational field, especially for learning electronic document management. The video quality assessment procedures are: (1) selection of learning videos on YouTube, videos are selected according to a predetermined theme, namely electronic document management; (2) video feasibility test, test using *expert judgment* involving 5 media experts and 5 material experts. The data collection instrument uses an instrument developed by Morain & Swarts (2012) with 3 indicators, namely *Physical Design*, *Cognitive Design*, and *Affective Design*. The assessment criteria include 3 categories, namely: good, sufficient, and not good. The data obtained was then analyzed using descriptive analysis.

## RESULT AND DISCUSSION

### Result

#### 1. Comparison of Practical and Theoretical Learning Videos on YouTube

The topic of YouTube video selection in this research is electronic document management. The videos found were then categorized between videos that support theoretical and practical learning. Based on the search results, 42 videos were found in the research theme with the following details:

**Table 2: Number of Videos by Category**

No.	Type	Total	Percentage
1	Theory	10	23,81%
2	Practices	32	76,19%
	Total	42	100,00%

Based on Table 2, it is known that videos on YouTube that support practical learning are 33 videos (76.19%) and theoretical learning is 10 videos (23.81%). Therefore, videos on YouTube can support learning in the vocational field with the theme of electronic document management dominated by videos that support practical learning as much as 76.19%.

#### 2. Video Quality Rating on YouTube

The video quality assessment in this study refers to the assessment instrument developed by Morain & Swarts (2012). The assessment is divided into 3 indicators, namely *Physical Design*, *Cognitive Design*, and *Affective Design*. The results of the video assessment based on quality are as follows:

## a. Theory Video Quality on YouTube

**Table 3. Theory Video Quality**

Category	Total	Percentage
Good	3	30%
Simply	6	60%
Not good	1	10%
	10	100%

Based on Table 3, it is known that the theoretical videos that are included in the good criteria are 60%, 30% are sufficient, and 10% are not good. Thus, it can be concluded that the theoretical videos on YouTube in vocational learning are mostly of good quality.

## b. Practice Video Quality on YouTube

**Table 4. Quality of Practice Videos**

Category	Total	Percentage
Good	18	56,25%
Simply	14	43,75%
Not good	0	0,00%
	32	100%

Based on Table 4, it is known that practical videos in vocational learning are included in the good criteria, namely 56.25%, 43.75% are sufficient, and 0% are not good. Thus, it can be concluded that practical videos on YouTube in vocational learning are mostly of good quality.

## c. YouTube Video Quality for Vocational Learning

**Table 5. Vocational Field Learning Videos by Quality**

Category	Video	Percentage
Good	21	63,64%
Simply	20	60,61%
Not good	1	3,03%
	42	127%

Based on Table 5, it is known that overall the vocational learning videos on YouTube that fall into the good criteria are 21 videos (63.64%), 20 videos (60.61%), and 1 video (3.03%). Thus, it can be concluded that overall the vocational learning videos on YouTube with the theme of electronic document management are mostly of good quality.

**Discussion**

## 1. YouTube and Learning in Vocational Fields

Vocational education is one of the fields of education that is required to produce skilled workers who are experts in their fields and ready to work (Sugiyo et al., 2020). The implication is that learning in the field of vocational education is expected not only to be limited to mastery of theory, but emphasizes more on direct practice. However, the limited learning hours in the classroom require students to be able to learn independently outside the classroom. Judging from their characteristics, students in higher education are currently dominated by the Z generation (Rakhmah & Azizah, 2020). As a generation that was born and grew up in the era of easy internet access, Generation Z prefers digital-based information sources and is more comfortable searching for information on audio-visual search pages, such as the YouTube

*platform* (Rakhmah & Azizah, 2020), so current students prefer to search for videos on YouTube as a medium for independent learning.

YouTube as the world's largest video-based *platform* has great potential in vocational learning as its videos emphasize the power of animation as an effective pedagogical tool (Liu and Elms, 2019). Animation combines audio and visual messages, enabling the presentation of complex concepts in an engaging way. In relation to the theme of this study, which is electronic document management, the use of animation can be an interesting strategy. By selecting the appropriate type of video, such as practical demonstrations or interactive tutorials, it can improve students' understanding and practical skills.

The results of data analysis showed that the search results on the YouTube *platform* for the theme of electronic document management found 42 videos and most of them were videos with practical learning categories with a percentage of 76.19%. This reinforces that learning in the vocational field emphasizes practical learning rather than theory, so that categorically the learning videos available on YouTube can be said to have supported learning in the vocational field.

## 2. Quality of Electronic Document Management Learning Videos on YouTube

YouTube not only provides abundant learning resources, but also a significant self-learning medium (Mohamed and Shoufan, 2022). Digital preparedness learning requires students to have practical skills or direct practice. By category, the videos on YouTube have met these criteria with the largest percentage of videos being learning videos with practical categories. However, the video cannot be said to be feasible or not as a digital archiving learning media, so further analysis needs to be done, namely by analyzing video quality.

Video quality assessment in this study, namely using *expert judgment*. The assessment was carried out by 5 material experts and 5 media experts. The assessment criteria in this study refer to the assessment developed by Morain & Swarts (2012) with 3 indicators, namely *Physical Design*, *Cognitive Design*, and *Affective Design*. *Physical Design* indicators include 3 categories, namely: *Accessibility*, *Viewability*, and *Timing*. *Accessibility* means that the video allows the audience to focus on the area of the screen that is relevant to the instructions given. *Viewability* means that the production quality (audio, video, and text) is sufficient to make the content worth watching. *Timing* means that the video is organized in a way that makes it easy for viewers to follow the content. Furthermore, the *Cognitive Design* indicator includes 3 assessment categories, namely *Accuracy*, *Completeness*, and *Pertinence*. *Accuracy* means that the content is presented without errors of fact or execution. *Completeness* means that the content is presented in an organized super structure and with enough detail so that it can be accurately reproduced and widely applied. *Pertinence* means that the content is related to the instructional objectives and has instructional meaning. Finally, the *Affective Design* indicator includes 3 categories, namely: *Confidence*, *Self-Efficacy*, *Engagement*. *Confidence* means that the narrator fosters self-confidence by presenting themselves as knowledgeable and skilled. The narrator can also foster confidence through association with reputable organizations. *Self-Efficacy* means that the video convinces viewers that they can successfully complete the task that is the focus of the instruction. *Engagement* means that the video is designed to interest and motivate the user.

The results of the video quality assessment for the theoretical video and practical video categories concluded that the learning videos on YouTube were mostly of good quality. These results are also corroborated by the results of the overall video assessment which concluded that the vocational learning videos on YouTube with the theme of electronic document management are mostly of good quality. The results of this study can be interpreted that the quality of learning videos on YouTube is feasible to use as a learning media for vocational fields, especially in digital readiness learning. The findings of this study can reinforce the results of previous research Liu and Elms (2019) and Aldallal et al. (2019) who found that



YouTube videos can be used as an effective learning media. In addition, the findings of this study also corroborate the results of Mohamed and Shoufan's (2022) research which states that YouTube is a significant self-learning medium, and Hew and Lo (2020) present information regarding the selection of appropriate video types that can improve students' understanding and practical skills.

## CONCLUSION

Based on the results and discussions that have been carried out, it is concluded that: (1) Learning videos on YouTube are more learning videos in the form of practice, and (2) Videos on YouTube for learning electronic document management are of good quality and are suitable for use as vocational learning media. Recommendations for further research are that follow-up needs to be done to see the effect of learning videos on YouTube on the level of student understanding.

## ACKNOWLEDGMENT

The group research team would like to thank Yogyakarta State University for funding this activity so that the research can be completed properly.

## REFERENCE

- Aldallal, S. N., et al. (2019). Use of YouTube™ as a Self-Directed Learning Resource in Oral Surgery among Undergraduate Dental Students: A Cross-Sectional Descriptive Study. *British Journal of Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery*, 57(10). <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.bjoms.2019.09.010>.
- Boateng, R., et al. (2016). Videos in Learning in Higher Education: Assessing Perceptions and Attitudes of Students at the University of Ghana. *Smart Learning Environments*, 3(8), doi:10.1186/s40561-016-0031-5.
- Celik, H., Polat, O., Ozcan, C., Camur, S., Kilinc, B. E., & Uzun, M. (2020). Assessment of the Quality and Reliability of the Information on Rotator Cuff Repair on YouTube. *Orthopaedics and Traumatology: Surgery and Research*, 106(1). <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.otsr.2019.10.004>.
- Chartrand, G., et al. (2021). Self-Directed Learning by Video as a Means to Improve Technical Skills in Surgery Residents: A Randomized Controlled Trial. *BMC Med Educ*, 21(1). doi:10.1186/s12909-021-02524-y.
- Copper, J., & Semich, G. (2015). YouTube as a teacher training tool: Information and communication technology as a delivery instrument for professional development. In *Professional Development and Workplace Learning: Concepts, Methodologies, Tools, and Applications* (Vol. 2, pp. 632-642). IGI Global. <https://doi.org/10.4018/978-1-4666-8632-8.ch037>.
- Dunlosky, J., Rawson, K. A., Marsh, E. J., Nathan, M. J., & Willingham, D. T. (2013). Improving students' learning with effective learning techniques: Promising directions from cognitive and educational psychology. In *Psychological Science in the Public Interest, Supplement* (Vol. 14, Issue 1, pp. 4-58). SAGE Publications Inc. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1529100612453266>.
- Ferhatoglu, M. F., Kartal, A., Ekici, U., & Gurkan, A. (2019). Evaluation of the Reliability, Utility, and Quality of the Information in Sleeve Gastrectomy Videos Shared on Open Access Video Sharing Platform YouTube. *Obesity Surgery*, 29(5). <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11695-019-03738-2>.
- Hew, K. F., & Lo, C. K. (2020). Comparing Video Styles and Study Strategies During Video-Recorded Lectures: Effect on Secondary School Mathematics Students' Preference and

- Learning. *Interactive Learning Environments*, 28(7).  
<https://doi.org/10.1080/10494820.2018.1545671>.
- Islam, J. P., Ulandari, R., Rahman K, A., & Busrah, Z. (2021). YouTube as an Islamic Education Learning Media during the Covid-19 Pandemic. *AL-ISHLAH: Journal of Islamic Education*, 19(1), 17-30.
- Liu, C., & Elms, P. (2019). Animating Student Engagement: The Impacts of Cartoon Instructional Videos on Learning Experience. *Research in Learning Technology*, 27. <https://doi.org/10.25304/rlt.v27.2124>.
- Mardapi, D. (2016). *Measurement, Assessment and Evaluation of Education*. Parama Publishing.
- Maudini, A., & Nurhasanah, A. (2018). Different Learning Strategies Preference Among Senior High School Students Of Different Programs. *PROJECT: Professional Journal of English Education*, 1(6), 769-774.  
<http://rate.org.ro/media/blogs/b/diagram.jpg?mtime=1474101081>.
- Milheim, K. L. (2012). Toward a Better Experience: Examining Student Needs in the Online Classroom through Maslow's Hierarchy of Needs Model. In *MERLOT Journal of Online Learning and Teaching* (Vol. 8, Issue 2).
- Mohamed, F., & Shoufan, A. (2022). Choosing YouTube videos for self-directed learning. *IEEE Access*, 10. doi:10.1109/ACCESS.2022.3174368.
- Mohamed, F., & Shoufan, A. (2022). Choosing YouTube videos for self-directed learning. Wong, D. (2020). Effectiveness of Learning Through Video Clips and Video Learning Improvements Between Business Related Postgraduate and Undergraduate Students. *International Journal of Modern Education*, 2(7). <https://doi.org/10.35631/ijmoe.27009>.
- Celik, H., Polat, O., Ozcan, C., Camur, S., Kilinc, B. E., & Uzun, M. (2020). Assessment of the Quality and Reliability of the Information on Rotator Cuff Repair on YouTube. *Orthopaedics and Traumatology: Surgery and Research*, 106(1), 31-34. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.otsr.2019.10.004>.
- Copper, J., & Semich, G. (2015). YouTube as a teacher training tool: Information and communication technology as a delivery instrument for professional development. In *Professional Development and Workplace Learning: Concepts, Methodologies, Tools, and Applications* (Vol. 2, pp. 632-642). IGI Global. <https://doi.org/10.4018/978-1-4666-8632-8.ch037>.
- Dunlosky, J., Rawson, K. A., Marsh, E. J., Nathan, M. J., & Willingham, D. T. (2013). Improving students' learning with effective learning techniques: Promising directions from cognitive and educational psychology. In *Psychological Science in the Public Interest, Supplement* (Vol. 14, Issue 1, pp. 4-58). SAGE Publications Inc. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1529100612453266>.
- Ferhatoglu, M. F., Kartal, A., Ekici, U., & Gurkan, A. (2019). Evaluation of the Reliability, Utility, and Quality of the Information in Sleeve Gastrectomy Videos Shared on Open Access Video Sharing Platform YouTube. *Obesity Surgery*, 29(5), 1477-1484. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11695-019-03738-2>.
- Islam, J. P., Ulandari, R., Rahman K, A., & Busrah, Z. (2021). YouTube as an Islamic Education Learning Media during the Covid-19 Pandemic. *AL-ISHLAH: Journal of Islamic Education*, 19(1), 17-30.
- Maudini, A., & Nurhasanah, A. (2018). Different Learning Strategies Preference Among Senior High School Students Of Different Programs. *PROJECT: Professional Journal of English Education*, 1(6), 769-774.  
<http://rate.org.ro/media/blogs/b/diagram.jpg?mtime=1474101081>.

- Milheim, K. L. (2012). Toward a Better Experience: Examining Student Needs in the Online Classroom through Maslow's Hierarchy of Needs Model. In *MERLOT Journal of Online Learning and Teaching* (Vol. 8, Issue 2).
- Mohamed, F., & Shoufan, A. (2022). Choosing YouTube Videos for Self-Directed Learning. *IEEE Access*, 10, 51155-51166. <https://doi.org/10.1109/ACCESS.2022.3174368>.
- Morain, M., & Swarts, J. (2012). Yoututorial: A framework for assessing instructional online video. *Technical Communication Quarterly*, 21(1), 6-24. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10572252.2012.626690>
- Mutoharoh, T., Dewi Kurnia, M., & Hasanudin, C. (2022). Utilization of YouTube Application for Learning Media. *Jubah Raja (Journal of Language, Literature, and Teaching)*, 1(2), 97-102.
- Nofiantoro, W. (2018). Changes in Secretarial Nomenclature to Office Administration between opportunities and challenges. *Indonesian Vocational National Seminar*, 8-13. [www.presidenri.go.id](http://www.presidenri.go.id).
- Purwandari, E. (2019). Utilization of YouTube as a Physics Learning Resource. *Journal of Education and Instruction (JOEAI)*, 2(2), 83-90. <https://doi.org/10.31539/joeai.v2i2.810>.
- Purwanti, E., & Vania, G. (2021). Classroom management: Applying appropriate strategies to enhance effective teaching. *Journal of Foreign Language Teaching and Learning*, 6(1). <https://doi.org/10.18196/ftl.v6i1.10638>.
- Rahayu, W. (2021). The Use of YouTube Videos as Learning Media for Early Childhood During the Covid-19 Pandemic. *Tambusai Journal of Education*, 5(3), 6150-6156.
- Rakhmah, D. N., & Azizah, S. N. (2020). Understanding the Post-millennial Generation: A Review of Student Learning Practices. *Indonesian Society*, 46(1), 49-64.
- Sistadewi, M. A. (2021). The Use of YouTube Media in Indonesian Language Learning during the Limited Face-to-Face School Period. In *Journal of Indonesian Language Education and Learning* (Vol. 10, Issue 2).
- Sugiyo, S., Tri, S., & Rahardjo, J. (2020). The Role of Vocational Education on the Advancement of Human Development in Indonesia. *International Conference on Science, Education and Technology (ISET)*, 443.
- Suharno, Pambudi, N. A., & Harjanto, B. (2020). Vocational education in Indonesia: History, development, opportunities, and challenges. In *Children and Youth Services Review* (Vol. 115). Elsevier Ltd. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.childyouth.2020.105092>.
- Sutirman, S., Yuliansah, Y., Muslikhah, & Isti, R. (2023). *The Effectiveness of Electronic Records Information System for Education (ERISE) Applications as a Learning Media of Record Management in the Era of the Industrial Revolution 4.0* (pp. 1094-1104). [https://doi.org/10.2991/978-2-494069-35-0\\_131](https://doi.org/10.2991/978-2-494069-35-0_131).